

Understand Bio-ethical Issues Related to Health Care

Unit. Legal and Ethical Responsibilities

Problem Area. Understand Legal and Ethical Boundaries

Lesson. Understand Bio-ethical Issues Related to Health Care

- **Student Learning Objective.** Instruction in this lesson should result in students achieving the following objective:

1 Describe bio-ethical issues related to health care.

- **List of Resources.** The following resources may be useful in teaching this lesson:

Badasch, S., and Chesebro, D. (2004). *Introduction to Health Occupations*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Simmers, L. (2004). *Diversified Health Occupations*. Clifton Park, NY: Thomson Delmar Learning.

<http://www.cdc.gov/tuskegee/timeline.htm>

<http://www.wikipedia.org>



■ List of Equipment, Tools, Supplies, and Facilities

- ✓ Overhead or PowerPoint projector
- ✓ Visual(s) from accompanying master(s)
- ✓ Copies of sample test, lab sheet(s), and/or other items designed for duplication
- ✓ Materials listed on duplicated items
- ✓ Computers with Internet access
- ✓ Classroom resource and reference materials

■ Terms. The following terms are presented in this lesson (shown in bold italics):

- ▶ bioethics
- ▶ clinical ethics
- ▶ cultural bioethics
- ▶ regulatory and policy bioethics
- ▶ theoretical bioethics

■ Interest Approach. Use an interest approach that will prepare the students for the lesson. Teachers often develop approaches for their unique class and student situations. A possible approach is included here.

Give the students the following introduction, and then lead a discussion using the following approach.

Bioethics can be traced back to the origins of medical ethics, beginning with the Hippocratic Oath in ancient Greece. It is linked to professional codes of ethics which were first established in 1794 by Thomas Percival and were first adopted by the American Medical Association in 1847. The term “bioethics” was first used by Van Renssalaer Potter to refer to a new field devoted to human survival and quality of life issues. The term bioethics has developed into a broad definition encompassing life science, medicine, biology, quality of life issues, etc.

As a class, brainstorm current bioethical issues. Discuss why these issues are so controversial and pros and cons associated with the issue.

SUMMARY OF CONTENT AND TEACHING STRATEGIES

Objective 1: Describe bio-ethical issues related to health care.

Anticipated Problem: What are bio-ethical issues related to health care?

- I. **Bioethics**—ethical questions that arise in the relationships between biology, medicine, cybernetics, politics, law, philosophy, and theology
 - A. Study of moral issues in the fields of medical treatment and research
 - B. Study of philosophical questions pertaining to the practice of medicine and health care
 - C. Ensures the community receives the highest standards of care and prevents health care providers from abusing the trust and power granted to them by the community
 - D. Four general areas to consider regarding bioethics:
 1. **Theoretical bioethics**—intellectual foundations of the field
 2. **Clinical ethics**—day-to-day moral decisions regarding the care of patients
 3. **Regulatory and policy bioethics**—legal and policy solutions for moral problems concerning life and death
 4. **Cultural bioethics**—ethical questions related to historical, ideological, cultural, and social contexts
 - E. Nuremberg Code for Research Ethics
 1. Established at the Nuremberg war crimes trial in response to gross abuses in human experimentation during World War II.
 2. Established 10 standards regarding experiments on human subjects:
 - a. Subjects must give voluntary consent.
 - b. The study must be for the good of society.
 - c. The study must be designed and based on the results of animal studies.
 - d. The study must be conducted to avoid unnecessary physical and mental suffering.
 - e. No experiment should be performed if there is reason to believe that death or disabling injury could occur.
 - f. The degree of risk should never exceed the importance of the problem to be solved.
 - g. Proper preparation should be taken to protect the subject from possible injury, disability, or death.
 - h. The study should be conducted only by scientifically qualified individuals.

- i. The subject should be able to end the experiment if he or she has reached a point where continuation seems mentally or physically impossible.
- j. The scientist in charge must be prepared to terminate the experiment if it becomes evident that injury, disability, or death could be possible.

F. Tuskegee Study

1. Lasting from 1932–1972, this was a study of syphilis progression using black males as the subjects.
2. Treatment (cures) was withheld to see how the disease progressed.
3. Men had freely agreed to participate, but they were not informed of the study or its real purpose.
4. Even when a cure was identified, it was never offered to the research subjects.
5. The study was ended in 1972.
6. In 1973, a class action lawsuit was filed and settled, with \$9 million being awarded to the study participants, as well as free medical treatment for participants and families.

G. Modern health care advances have created many ethical dilemmas for health care providers:

1. Distribution of scarce resources
2. Medical research and practice
3. Animal testing
4. Reproductive technologies
5. Genetic technologies
6. End-of-life issues
7. Euthanasia
8. Medical marijuana
9. Cloning
10. Stem cell research
11. Provider privacy issues (e.g., a doctor with AIDS)
12. Organ transplantation and selling
13. Religious rights
14. Parental rights
15. Refusal of service based on ability to pay
16. Abortion

Many techniques can be used to help students master this objective. As an example, students could use Internet searches to help further understand bioethics. Use VM–A, VM–B, VM–C, and VM–D to further illustrate bioethics and other concepts learned in this unit, and use LS–A to emphasize concepts learned in this lesson.

■ **Review/Summary.** Use the student learning objective to summarize the lesson. Have students explain the content associated with the objective. Student responses can be used in determining if the objective needs to be reviewed or taught from a different angle. Questions at the ends of chapters in the textbook may also be used in the review/summary.

■ **Application.** Use the included visual masters and lab sheet to apply the information presented in the lesson.

■ **Evaluation.** Evaluation should focus on student achievement of the objective for the lesson. Various techniques can be used, such as student performance on the application activities. A sample written test is provided.

■ **Answers to Sample Test:**

Part One: Short Answer

1. The Nuremberg Code for Research Ethics was established at the Nuremberg war crimes trial as a result of gross abuses in human experimentation during World War II. The code outlines 10 standards regarding experiments on human subjects.
2. The Tuskegee Study was designed to track the progression of syphilis. The study used poor black males as the subjects. The men freely participated, but were not told the real purpose of the study. Treatment was withheld from the subjects even when a cure was identified. In 1972 the study was ended by the government. In 1973 a class action lawsuit was filed and settled for \$9 million, as well as free medical treatment for the participants and their families.

Part Two: Matching

1. e
2. c
3. d
4. b
5. a

Understand Bio-ethical Issues Related to Health Care

► Part One: Short Answer

Instructions: Complete the following.

1. Briefly describe the Nuremburg Code for Research Ethics and its purpose.

2. Briefly describe the history of the Tuskegee Study.

► Part Two: Matching

Instructions: Match the term with the correct definition.

- | | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|
| a. bioethics | d. regulatory and policy bioethics |
| b. clinical ethics | e. theoretical bioethics |
| c. cultural bioethics | |

- ____ 1. Intellectual foundations of bioethics
- ____ 2. Ethical questions related to historical, ideological, cultural, and social contexts
- ____ 3. Legal and policy solutions for moral problems concerning life and death
- ____ 4. Day-to-day moral decisions regarding the care of patients
- ____ 5. Ethical questions that arise in the relationships between biology, medicine, cybernetics, politics, law, philosophy, and theology



Bioethical Issues

Overview

Health Science Technology students will research a bioethical issue and write a persuasive paper supporting or opposing the issue. Students will also provide information that supports the stand they have taken. Students will be evaluated accordingly:

- ◆ *Knowledge of Evidence from Bioethical Issue:* Facts / supporting details; themes/issues; and concepts/ideas.
- ◆ *Communication:* Demonstrates knowledge and reasoning through written communication.

Procedures

1. In order to understand and explain basic principles of the United States government, students should experience sufficient learning opportunities to develop the following skill:
 - ◆ Analyze the fundamental principles of our political system that often come into conflict (e.g., rule of law, liberty and equality, individual rights and the common good, separation of powers, majority rule and minority rights).

Students employed in various health care careers are required to have an understanding of bioethical issues and their impact on society. It is important for them to understand that there are two sides to each of the issues. This assessment aligns with the National Knowledge and Skills Ethics Standard.

2. Health Science Technology students will review and discuss the assessment task and how the rubric will be used to evaluate their work.
3. Students will research a bioethical issue and write a persuasive paper supporting or opposing the issue. The paper should include information that confirms either the support or opposition of the issue.
4. This assignment may be given as a homework assignment.
5. Each student's performance will be evaluated using the rubric. Add each student's scores to determine the performance level.

Time Requirements

2–3 days as a homework assignment

Resources

- ◆ Student Instructions
- ◆ List of bioethical issues
- ◆ Bioethical Issues Scoring Rubric

Bioethical Issues

You will research a bioethical issue from the attached list and write a persuasive paper either supporting or opposing the issue. Be sure to include facts to support your position on the issue.

The assignment should include the following:

1. Research a bioethical issue;
2. Decide whether to support or oppose the issue;
3. Write a persuasive paper supporting your position on the issue.

Bioethical Issues:

- ◆ abortion
- ◆ animal rights
- ◆ artificial insemination
- ◆ assisted suicide
- ◆ circumcision
- ◆ cloning
- ◆ contraception
- ◆ cryogenics
- ◆ euthanasia
- ◆ feeding tube
- ◆ gene therapy
- ◆ human genetic engineering
- ◆ infertility treatments
- ◆ life support



- ◆ lobotomy
- ◆ medical marijuana
- ◆ medical research
- ◆ organ donation (fair allocation)
- ◆ pain management
- ◆ parental rights (related to health care)
- ◆ recreational drug use
- ◆ religious rights (related to health care)
- ◆ sperm and/or egg donation
- ◆ stem cell research
- ◆ suicide
- ◆ surrogacy
- ◆ transplant trade
- ◆ universal health care

Bioethical Issues

- ◆ Exceeds standard (7–8 total points)
- ◆ Meets standard (5–6 total points)
- ◆ Approaches standard (3–4 total points)
- ◆ Begins standard (2 total points)

	Knowledge of Evidence from the Bioethical Issue: facts / supporting details; themes/issues; and concepts/ideas	Communication: Demonstrates knowledge and reasoning through written communication
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are thoroughly identified, defined, and described. • Has little or no factual inaccuracies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All ideas in the written assignment are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. • The bioethical issue and position show substantial evidence of organization. • The written assignment shows no mistakes in attention to details.
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined, and described. • May have a major factual inaccuracy, but most information is correct. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most ideas in the written assignment are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. • The bioethical issue and position demonstrate adequate evidence of organization. • The written assignment has mistakes in attention to the details.
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined, and described. • Has some correct and some incorrect information. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some ideas in the written assignment are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. • The bioethical issue and position demonstrate inadequate evidence of organization. • The written assignment has insufficient attention to the details.
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Few or no key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined, and described. • Information is largely inaccurate, absent, or irrelevant. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expression of almost all ideas in the written assignment is unclear. • The bioethical issue and position demonstrate little or no evidence of organization. • The written assignment has multiple mistakes in attention to the details.
Score		

BIOETHICS

Ethical questions that arise in the relationships between biology, medicine, cybernetics, politics, law, philosophy, and theology

Four general areas to consider regarding bioethics:

1. **Theoretical bioethics**—intellectual foundations of the field
2. **Clinical ethics**—day-to-day moral decisions regarding the care of patients
3. **Regulatory and policy bioethics**—legal and policy solutions for moral problems concerning life and death
4. **Cultural bioethics**—ethical questions related to historical, ideological, cultural, and social contexts



NUREMBERG CODE FOR RESEARCH ETHICS

Established 10 standards regarding experiments on human subjects:

- ◆ Subjects must give voluntary consent.
- ◆ The study must be for the good of society.
- ◆ The study must be designed and based on the results of animal studies.
- ◆ The study must be conducted to avoid unnecessary physical and mental suffering.
- ◆ No experiment should be performed if there is reason to believe that death or disabling injury could occur.
- ◆ The degree of risk should never exceed the importance of the problem to be solved.
- ◆ Proper preparation should be taken to protect the subject from possible injury, disability, or death.
- ◆ The study should be conducted only by scientifically qualified individuals.
- ◆ The subject should be able to end the experiment if he or she has reached a point where continuation seems mentally or physically impossible.
- ◆ The scientist in charge must be prepared to terminate the experiment if it becomes evident that injury, disability, or death could be possible.

TUSKEGEE STUDY

- ◆ Lasting from 1932–1972, this was a study of syphilis progression using black males as the subjects.
- ◆ Treatment (cures) was withheld to see how the disease progressed.
- ◆ Men had freely agreed to participate, but they were not informed of the study or its real purpose.
- ◆ Even when a cure was identified, it was never offered to the research subjects.
- ◆ The study was ended in 1972.
- ◆ In 1973, a class action lawsuit was filed and settled, with \$9 million being awarded to the study participants, as well as free medical treatment for participants and families.



ETHICAL DILEMMAS

- ◆ Distribution of scarce resources
- ◆ Medical research and practice
- ◆ Animal testing
- ◆ Reproductive technologies
- ◆ Genetic technologies
- ◆ End-of-life issues
- ◆ Euthanasia
- ◆ Medical marijuana
- ◆ Cloning
- ◆ Stem cell research
- ◆ Provider privacy issues (e.g., a doctor with AIDS)
- ◆ Organ transplantation and selling
- ◆ Religious rights
- ◆ Parental rights
- ◆ Refusal of service based on ability to pay
- ◆ Abortion



Bioethics

Purpose

The purpose of this activity is to reinforce concepts learned in this unit. Students will be able to explore current issues related to legal aspects of health care.

Objectives

1. Examine bioethical issues.
2. Explore current issues related to legal aspects of health care.

Materials

- ◆ writing utensil
- ◆ paper

Procedure

1. On a separate sheet, have students answer the questions below.
2. Select several students to share their answers, and ask the class to evaluate whether the answer is appropriate for the question.
 - a. What is bioethics?
 - b. What are the four general areas to consider regarding bioethics?
 - c. List the 10 standards outlined in the Nuremberg Code for Research Ethics.
 - d. Briefly describe the Tuskegee Study.

Bioethics

(Listed below are possible answers for the lab sheet)

- a. Bioethics deals with ethical questions that arise in the relationships between biology, medicine, cybernetics, politics, law, philosophy, and theology.
- b. Four general areas to consider regarding bioethics include:
 - Theoretical bioethics—intellectual foundations of the field
 - Clinical ethics—day-to-day moral decisions regarding the care of patients
 - Regulatory and policy bioethics—legal and policy solutions for moral problems concerning life and death
 - Cultural bioethics—ethical questions related to historical, ideological, cultural, and social contexts
- c. The 10 standards outlined in the Nuremberg Code for Research Ethics are:
 - Subjects must give voluntary consent.
 - The study must be for the good of society.
 - The study must be designed and based on the results of animal studies.
 - The study must be conducted to avoid unnecessary physical and mental suffering.
 - No experiment should be performed if there is reason to believe that death or disabling injury could occur.
 - The degree of risk should never exceed the importance of the problem to be solved.
 - Proper preparation should be taken to protect the subject from possible injury, disability, or death.
 - The study should be conducted only by scientifically qualified individuals.
 - The subject should be able to end the experiment if he or she has reached a point where continuation seems mentally or physically impossible.
 - The scientist in charge must be prepared to terminate the experiment if it becomes evident that injury, disability, or death could be possible.
- d. The Tuskegee Study was designed to track the progression of syphilis. The study used poor black males as the subjects. The men freely participated, but were not told the real purpose of the study. Treatment was withheld from the subjects even when a cure was identified. In 1972 the study was ended by the government. In 1973 a class action lawsuit was filed and settled for \$9 million, as well as free medical treatment for the participants and their families.